

FM REVIEW 2019 15 COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO EDITOR: This essay describes the professional and personal impact of a fractured shoulder on a busy family physician. Reviewers liked it more than I did. For me, it was somewhat deficient in reflection and insight. However, reviewers really resonated to the dilemma of how to responsibly fulfill commitment to colleagues and patients while experiencing significantly diminished function. In this sense, the essay does address the question of what happens when the doctor becomes a patient in an honest and detailed manner.

I'm requesting that the author make an effort to be a little more self-reflective and disclosing. Otherwise I have no criticisms. She is a confident writer, and tells her story in a clear and accessible fashion.

COMMENTS TO AUTHOR: Your essay offers a well-observed description of the professional and personal impact of a severely fractured shoulder on a busy family physician. Reviewers resonated to the dilemma of how to responsibly fulfill commitments to colleagues and patients while experiencing significantly diminished function. In this sense, the essay address an important and vulnerable question of what happens when the doctor becomes a patient. Your essay offers us a candid and detailed response.

The only critique I'd make is that the essay could be one step more reflective and self-aware. You provide plenty of examples of how your colleagues and family stepped up to support you; as well as the extraordinary steps you took to return to your teaching and eventually your clinical duties as quickly as possible. Can you provide a little more insight into how your injury "rippled" outward from you to family and co-workers not only instrumentally (what they did) but emotionally (how they – and you - felt). For example, you say that your daughters learning to cook was a benefit to the household. Did they grow or change in other more internal ways as a result of their added responsibilities? Similarly, your fellow physicians stepped forward to pick up the clinical slack. Did this make your practice stronger? Complicate it? What was it like for you, who obviously have such an ingrained sense of responsibility to others, to have to learn to accept help? If you can show us more of the "inner workings" of this experience, it would make an already well-written and honestly observed essay even more compelling.

COMMENTS TO EDITOR II: The author has done a meticulous revision of her manuscript based on feedback from both reviewers and assistant editor. She has substantially improved the essay, making it more personal and revealing. The paper is also better organized around the theme of various "waves" of challenging the author, her family, and her work. I'm recommending minor changes throughout the manuscript, mostly to tighten, clarify, and improve the flow of the writing. It should be ready for publication after one further round.

COMMENTS TO AUTHOR II: Thank you for this excellent revision. The attention you paid to each reviewer's comments and suggestions was truly impressive. The result is a substantially improved essay. You dug deep to explore the personal and emotional ramifications of each "wave," which will

enhance the value to our readers. The manuscript is also very well organized now, making it easier to follow.

I'm recommending some minor changes throughout the manuscript, mostly to tighten, clarify, and improve the flow of the writing. Either please accept these or rewrite as you think appropriate.

Thank you again for an honest and revealing essay. The lessons you learned will have great value for our readers.

COMMENTS TO EDITOR III: This essay should be accepted. The author has agreed to all recommended changes, but she has not accepted track-changes. Rather than send the essay back to her again, I think we can do this for her.

COMMENTS TO AUTHOR III: Thank you for agreeing to the recommended changes, we are delighted to have this honest, self-revealing essay in our journal. When the doctor becomes the patient, there is opportunity for growth and learning. Thanks for helping us witness some of these lessons.